BEST EVIDENCE TOPIC REPORTS

Towards evidence based emergency medicine: best BETs from the Manchester Royal Infirmary

Edited by K Mackway-Jones

Best evidence topic reports (BETs) summarise the evidence pertaining to particular clinical questions. They are not systematic reviews, but rather contain the best (highest level) evidence that can be practically obtained by busy practising clinicians. The search strategies used to find the best evidence are reported in detail in order to allow clinicians to update searches whenever necessary.

The BETs published below were first reported at the Critical Appraisal Journal Club at the Manchester Royal Infirmary.1 Each BET has been constructed in the four stages that have been described elsewhere.2 The five topics covered in this issue of the journal are:

1. Radiography for fish bones in the throat
2. Mobilisation of neck sprains
3. Oral or topical antibiotics for impetigo
4. Conservative or surgical management for first patellar dislocation
5. Splint or surgical cylinder for first patellar dislocation

---

Radiography for fish bones in the throat

Report by Lesley Bethune, Specialist Registrar

Clinical scenario
A 40 year old man attends the emergency department having recently eaten fish. He feels that a bone has got stuck in his throat. Examination of the oropharynx does not reveal a bone. You wonder whether an x-ray would aid diagnosis.

Three part question
In [patients who might have a fish bone in the throat] is [an x-ray of the neck] indicated to [diagnose and locate the bone]?

Search strategy
Medline 1966 to 6/99 using the OVID interface. ([exp fishes OR fish$.mp] AND [exp bone and bones OR bone$.mp] OR fish-bone$) AND [exp pharynx OR throat.mp OR exp oropharynx OR oropharynx.mp]).

Search outcome
Forty two papers were found of which were 37 irrelevant and two of insufficient quality for inclusion. The three remaining papers are shown in table 1.

Comment
While there are many studies that show that fish bones can be seen on x-ray, the studies in the table show that the clinical utility and accuracy of lateral neck radiography is poor in the clinical situation.

Clinical bottom line
Lateral neck x-ray is not indicated in the emergency department management of suspected fish bone impaction.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author, date, and country</th>
<th>Patient group</th>
<th>Study type (level of evidence)</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
<th>Key results</th>
<th>Study weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ngan et al, Hong Kong, 19901</td>
<td>310 of 358 patients over the age of 12 years complaining of fish bone ingestion</td>
<td>Prospective diagnostic</td>
<td>Sensitivity</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>Small numbers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evans et al, Hong Kong, 19922</td>
<td>100 neck radiographs of patients with known fish bones mixed with 100 normal control films Each assessed by two radiologists</td>
<td>Diagnostic</td>
<td>Sensitivity</td>
<td>25.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sundgren et al, Sweden, 19943</td>
<td>42 consecutive patients with fish bone ingestion</td>
<td>Retrospective diagnostic</td>
<td>Sensitivity</td>
<td>28.6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Correspondence to: Kevin Mackway-Jones, Consultant (e-mail: kmackway@f1.mci.man.ac.uk).